

ISAF Racing Rules Question and Answer Service



J 016

Q&A 2015.015

Published: 23 October 2015

Situation

The paragraph titled Appendices in the Introduction to the Racing Rules of Sailing includes the following statement:

'When the rules of an appendix apply, they take precedence over any conflicting rules in Parts 1-7 and the Definitions.'

Appendix P applies in all the situations described.

Question 1

Does the fact that Appendix P applies prevent a boat or a race committee or protest committee member from lodging a protest under rule 60 alleging a breach of rule 42?

Answer 1

No. Appendix P does not change or delete rule 60, nor does rule 60 conflict with Appendix P. However, when Appendix P is in effect, race committees and protest committees should recognize the potential for unfairness if they act under rule 60. When one boat is penalized on the water under rule P2.1, she may take her two turns penalty and still score well in the race. Another boat in the same race that is protested by the RC or the PC under rule 60 would, if the protest is upheld, be disqualified from the race.

Question 2

If the answer to Question 1 is No, may a protest committee member on the water choose not to penalise a boat for a breach of rule 42 with a yellow flag, but instead lodge a protest under rule 60.3(a) for the same breach?

Answer 2

Yes. Rule P1 states that a member of the protest committee**may** penalizeunder the rule, but is not required to do so. However, when appendix P applies, judges are expected to penalize boats for breaches of rule 42 under P1 on the water. Lodging a protest under rule 60.3(a) instead would be clearly unfair as it would cause different penalties depending on how the judges decide to act. See Answer 1.

Question 3

If no boat or qualified judge for on-the-water judging is available in spite of Appendix P applying, may the protest committee lodge a protest under rule 60.3(a) for a breach of rule 42?

Answer 3

Yes, as long as conditions mentioned in 60.3(a) are fulfilled.

Question 4

If Appendix P applies and no penalty has been given on the water, may the protest committee protest a boat under rule 60.3(a)(2) for a breach of rule 42?

Answer 4

Yes, if during the hearing of a valid protest the protest committee learn that the boat broke rule 42 while being involved in the incident in question, it may protest the boat. If the facts found show that the boat broke rule 42 it should be penalized. However, see Answer 1 and rule P1 last sentence.

Question 5

Whether or not Appendix P applies, may a boat (competitor) protest another boat under rule 60.1(a) for a breach of rule 42?

Answer 5

Yes, however the protest committee cannot penalize the protestee if she has already been penalized on the water for the same breach.